

## **BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS**

**JULY 17, 2025**

A Municipal Service Benefit Unit (MSBU) Public Hearing was held at Lemon Bay High School, 2201 Placida Rd, Englewood, Florida.

The following members were present: Chair Tiseo, Commissioner Constance (arrived at 5:17 pm), Commissioner Deutsch, Commissioner Doherty, and Commissioner Truex. Also in attendance were: County Administrator Flores, County Attorney Knowlton, Minutes Clerk Welsh, and various County staff members. The following members were absent: None.

**The Meeting was called to order at 5:01 pm**, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

### **Changes to the Agenda**

**Change #1:** Item 1, Added attachment - How Your Dollar is Spent.

Requested by: Budget & Administrative Services

**Change #2:** Item 1, Added attachment – July MSBU Public Hearing Backup.

Requested by: Budget & Administrative Services

**COMMISSIONER DOHERTY MOVED TO APPROVE CHANGES TO THE AGENDA, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TRUEX**

**MOTION CARRIED 4:0., COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE ABSENT**

### **1. Public Hearings to Set MSBU Rates**

**(Change #1)** Added attachment - How Your Dollar is Spent.

**(Change #2)** Added attachment – July MSBU Public Hearing Backup.

Richard Arthur, Fiscal Services Manager gave a brief overview of How Your Tax Dollar is Spent - Fiscal Year (FY) 2025/2026, Agenda, Stages of the Budget Process, and Budget Process Calendar.

#### **a. Englewood East Street and Drainage Unit (RES 2025-231)**

John Elias, Public Works Director gave a brief overview of Englewood East Street and Drainage, Englewood East Street and Drainage - Proposed Maximum Rate, Where Does Your Municipal Service Benefit Unit (MSBU) Dollar Go - Englewood East Street and Drainage, responded to MSBU and ad valorem assessments, Sidewalk Master Plan, maintenance, and usage, drainage concerns and equipment purchases, bridge rehabilitation, street signs and lights, paving process, speed bump pilot program, spending timeframe, surface cracking and sealing, deferment impacts and costs, additional staff requests, sunseting, options, and September 4, 2025 First Budget Public Hearing.

## Public Input

The following citizens spoke against increasing the rate by \$160 to \$350 for phased paving to begin in FY 2026: Jennifer McKenna, Betham Burkhart, Tatyana Morder, Gerald Donofrio, Vincent Walker, Manny Reyes, Jerry Robinson, Stacy Supienski, Pauline Pedula, Kelli Rupe, Sheila Reed, Joan Riswold, Andrea Jenkins, Nancy Hart, Victoria Gosselin, Steve Kalaf, John Wudkwyh Jr., Sandy Heim, Lee Hargis, Rick Engelauf, Patrick Maley, Michael Nicholson, Patricia Seminelli, Brett Clutter, Crystal Motuzas, Gary D'Auria, Theodore Chorny, J Reynolds, Catherine Heart, Mildred Weber, Alex Kuchma, Patrice Rutter, Rose Zammit, Joseph Blackurn, Stan Putrya, Peter Simonetti, and Frank Blake.

LuAnn Overby remarked on Material Safety Data Sheet, asphalt composition, paving materials, drainage issues, sheet flow, and Ajax Paving performance.

Glen Burnap, Englewood East Non-urban Street and Drainage Unit Chairman spoke in support of increasing the rate by \$160 to \$350 for phased paving to begin in FY 2026.

Carol Leonard discussed assessment rates, service benefits, overgrown parcels, Where Does Your MSBU Dollar Go - Englewood East Street and Drainage, drainage and road conditions, staffing needs, and budget adjustments.

Loretta Nelson mentioned drainage issues, Where Does Your MSBU Dollar Go - Englewood East Street and Drainage, paving costs and program, greenspace, property development and rights, speed bumps, sidewalks, and enforcement.

## COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE MOVED TO CLOSE PUBLIC INPUT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DOHERTY

### MOTION CARRIED 5:0.

**Chair Tiseo** discussed bridge rehabilitation, paving project and methodology, funding redistribution, road inspection process and prioritization, asphalt milling, cost saving measures, project deferment impacts, financial challenges, drainage, current assessment rate and options, amortization, and sidewalk program allocation. **Commissioner Constance** mentioned Englewood East Street and Drainage, property reassessment, Charlotte County Property Appraiser Tax Estimator website, Material Safety Data Sheet, paving program, and unit funding contributions. **Commissioner Deutsch** commented on timelines, subsurface deterioration, inflationary cycle, hurricane damages, flooding, prioritization, financial struggles, deferment impacts, sidewalk usage, assessment rates, and drainage materials. **Commissioner Doherty** spoke to sidewalk value and program, equivalent residential unit (ERU), MSBU assessment collection and rates, paving program costs and deferment, road surface conditions and deterioration, collector and main road prioritization, drainage issues and service requests, work program funding redistribution and spending timeframe, scenarios, and September 4, 2025 First Budget Public Hearing. **Commissioner Truex** noted Big W Law Firm assessments, Save Our Homes and Homestead Exemptions, property sale impacts, unit funding contributions, extension costs and impacts, rate reduction, drainage program and collected funding, staff efforts, alternative options, and cost savings.

Karlene McDonald, Public Works Operations Supervisor replied to paving program phases.

Mr. Arthur responded to paving program reprioritization, maximum amortization, and timeline.

County Attorney Knowlton interjected on proposed assessment rate.

**COMMISSIONER DOHERTY MOVED TO APPROVE RESOLUTION 2025-231 ADOPTING THE FINAL MAINTENANCE ASSESSMENT AND AN ASSESSMENT ROLL FOR THE ENGLEWOOD EAST (NON-URBAN) STREET AND DRAINAGE UNIT AS DRAFTED, REALLOCATING \$58 FROM SIDEWALKS TO GO TOWARDS DRAINAGE, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TRUEX**

**COMMISSIONER DEUTSCH MOVED TO AMEND THE MOTION TO ADJUST THE MAXIMUM ASSESSMENT RATE TO \$292 PER UNIT, FINISH ALL PHASES OF THE PAVING PROGRAM, AND FUNDING INCLUDED FOR SOME DRAINAGE AND BRIDGE WORK, SECONDED BY CHAIR TISEO**

**MOTION CARRIED 3:2., COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE AND COMMISSIONER DOHERTY OPPOSED**

**b. Gardens of Gulf Cove Street and Drainage Unit (RES 2025-232)**

Mr. Elias gave a brief overview of Gardens of Gulf Cove Street and Drainage, Gardens of Gulf Cove Street and Drainage - Proposed Maximum Rate, Where Does Your MSBU Dollar Go - Gardens of Gulf Cove Street and Drainage, replied to curb and gutter challenges, drainage systems and paving work program costs, pipe replacements and lining, roadway failures, hurricane events, budget timelines, Reserve level requirements, assessment rate reduction timeline and collections, MSBU Meetings attendance and ERU totals, Charlotte County School Board fence replacement, mangrove trimming, non-navigable waterways, and alternatives.

**Public Input**

Jim Newkirk, Gardens of Gulf Cove Street and Drainage Unit Vice Chairman remarked on budget requests and details, operational expenses, Reserve funding and levels, paving project budget, drainage system upgrade costs, Early Waterway, and vegetation clearing.

The following citizens spoke against increasing the rate by \$265 to \$615 for an increase to costs associated with paving and pipe lining: Rob Raiser, Scott Sickles, Doreen Sickles, Shannon Crank, Colleen Carver, Trish Kansman-Cooper, Wanda Williamson, Richard Liebel, Frank Scheiber, and Kevin Brisker.

**COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE MOVED TO CLOSE PUBLIC INPUT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DOHERTY**

**MOTION CARRIED 5:0.**

**Chair Tiseo** discussed Reserve Policy, flexibility, contingency fund level, rate options, financial challenges, collector and spine roads, unit benefits, Charlotte County School Board fence, Myakka River, mangrove maintenance, MSBU benefit requirements, September 4, 2025 First Budget Public Hearing, Workshop, and ERUs. **Commissioner Constance** mentioned paving history and collected assessment balance, road conditions and reconstruction, Coliseum Boulevard, drainage systems, main collector roads, September 4, 2025 First Budget Public Hearing, and rate reduction alternatives. **Commissioner Deutsch** commented on proposed assessment rate increase, financial challenges, Reserve levels, and reduction. **Commissioner Doherty** noted paving and drainage work program, unit benefit, road conditions and resurfacing, State Road (SR) 776, cost and rate reduction, modifications, and Workshop. **Commissioner Truex** spoke to Reserve level requirements, work program, assessment rate reduction timeline, cost savings, alternate scenarios, and MSBU restrictions.

Mr. Arthur remarked on budgeted expenses, hurricane recovery efforts, replied to Reserve Policy levels and requirements, alternatives, work program assessments, and September 4, 2025 First Budget Public Hearing.

County Attorney Knowlton interjected on Board Policy, collected assessments, paving work program, unit benefit delivery timeframe, and collector roads.

**COMMISSIONER DOHERTY MOVED TO APPROVE RESOLUTION 2025-232 ADOPTING THE FINAL MAINTENANCE ASSESSMENT AND AN ASSESSMENT ROLL FOR THE GARDENS OF GULF COVE STREET AND DRAINAGE UNIT, ADJUSTING THE MAXIMUM RATE TO \$591 PER UNIT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TRUEX**

**MOTION CARRIED 3:2., CHAIR TISEO AND COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE OPPOSED**

c. Placida Area Street and Drainage Unit (RES 2025-233)

Mr. Arthur discussed May 20, 2025 MSBU Workshop, transparency, debt services formula, pipelining cost estimate increases, Reserve levels, assessment timeframe, and MSBU Advisory Committee.

Mr. Elias gave a brief overview of Placida Area Street and Drainage, Placida Area Street and Drainage - Proposed Maximum Rate, Where Does Your MSBU Dollar Go - Placida Area Street and Drainage, replied to sidewalk program petition and connections, rate reduction, and pipe costs.

**Chair Tiseo** mentioned increased assessment timeframe, sidewalk and pipe work program, rate reduction, contingency funds, Workshop, and insurance challenges. **Commissioner Constance** commented on debt service and assessment rate reduction, work program cost increase, Collier and Charlotte County's property tax base and millage, population, hurricane damage, and insurance and financial challenges. **Commissioner Doherty** noted Sarasota and Lee Counties, municipalities, and public services. **Commissioner Truex** spoke to alternative rate reducing scenarios, September 4, 2025 First Budget Public Hearing, and Reserve levels.

**Public Input**

The following citizens spoke against increasing the rate by \$299.85 to \$535 for planned sidewalks in FY 2026: Mary Ann Walczak, William Carlson, Richard Carpenter, Eva Furner, David Murabito, Gerard Gallant, Philip Gangemi, and Geraldine Schreibman.

**COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE MOVED TO CLOSE PUBLIC INPUT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DOHERTY**

**MOTION CARRIED 5:0.**

**COMMISSIONER DOHERTY MOVED TO APPROVE RESOLUTION 2025-233 ADOPTING THE FINAL MAINTENANCE ASSESSMENT AND AN ASSESSMENT ROLL FOR THE PLACIDA AREA STREET AND DRAINAGE UNIT, ADJUSTING THE MAXIMUM RATE TO \$385 PER UNIT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER TRUEX**

**MOTION CARRIED 5:0.**

**COMMISSIONER DEUTSCH MOVED TO AMEND THE MOTION TO LEAVE THE ASSESSMENT RATE AT \$235.15**

## **MOTION FAILS DUE TO LACK OF SECOND**

### **d. South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage Unit (RES 2025-234)**

Mr. Elias gave a brief overview of South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage, South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage Unit Phases 2, 3, 4, 5, South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage - Proposed Maximum Rate, Where Does Your MSBU Dollar Go - South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage, and responded to bridge work program and life expectancy.

#### **Public Input**

The following citizens spoke against increasing the rate by \$14 to \$119 for an increase in costs associated with bridge repairs: Neil Richman, Kevin Meile, and Laura Cane.

**COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE MOVED TO CLOSE PUBLIC INPUT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DOHERTY**

**MOTION CARRIED 5:0.**

**Chair Tiseo** discussed identified bridge repairs and life expectancy and voter-approved Sales Tax Projects. **Commissioner Constance** mentioned bridge work program.

**COMMISSIONER DOHERTY MOVED TO APPROVE RESOLUTION 2025-233 ADOPTING THE FINAL MAINTENANCE ASSESSMENT AND AN ASSESSMENT ROLL FOR THE SOUTH GULF COVE (NON-URBAN) STREET AND DRAINAGE UNIT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE**

**MOTION CARRIED 5:0.**

### **e. South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage Unit – Phases 2, 3, 4, 5 (RES 2025-235)**

Mr. Elias gave a brief overview of South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage, South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage Phases 2, 3, 4, 5, South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage - Proposed Maximum Rate, Where Does Your MSBU Dollar Go - South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage, replied to ERU formula, Phase 1 completion date and assessment rate, and paving work program.

#### **Public Input**

The following citizens spoke against increasing the rate to \$306 for paving in areas designate as Phase 2, 3, 4 and 5: Neal Richman, Stan Putrya, Linda Souza, and Grace Mace.

**COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE MOVED TO CLOSE PUBLIC INPUT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DOHERTY**

**MOTION CARRIED 5:0.**

**Chair Tiseo** commented on methodology, combined parcels, Homestead Exemption, current and previous expired max assessment rate, South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage Phases 2, 3, 4, 5, paving work program, road inspections, contingency levels, cost savings, and consistency. **Commissioner Constance** spoke to South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage

Phases 2, 3, 4, 5, maximum assessment rate, Phase 1 paving cost, vacant and occupied lots, and ERUs. **Commissioner Doherty** noted combined parcel ERU assessments.

Mr. Arthur responded to Reserve levels and maximum rate.

County Attorney Knowlton interjected on ERU.

**COMMISSIONER CONSTANCE MOVED TO APPROVE RESOLUTION 2025-233 ADOPTING THE FINAL MAINTENANCE ASSESSMENT AND AN ASSESSMENT ROLL FOR THE SOUTH GULF COVE (NON-URBAN) STREET AND DRAINAGE UNIT – PHASES 2 THROUGH 5 PAVING, ADJUSTING THE MAXIMUM RATE OF \$300 PER UNIT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DOHERTY**

**MOTION CARRIED 4:1., COMMISSIONER DEUTSCH OPPOSED**

**AA. County Administrator Comments - None**

**BB. County Attorney Comments - None**

**CC. Commissioner Comments**

**Commissioner Constance** discussed South Gulf Cove Street and Drainage MSBU Advisory Board approval.

**ADJOURNED: 11:05 pm**

---

**Joseph M. Tiseo, Chair**

**DATE ADOPTED:** \_\_\_\_\_

**ATTEST:**

**ROGER D. EATON, CLERK  
OF THE CIRCUIT COURT AND  
EX-OFFICIO TO THE BOARD  
OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS**

**By:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Deputy Clerk**